

**YESHIVA UNIVERSITY
WURZWEILER SCHOOL OF SOCIAL WORK
DOCTORAL PROGRAM IN SOCIAL WELFARE**

SWK 8904 DISSERTATION PROPOSAL SEMINAR I: LITERATURE REVIEW

Richard K. Caputo, MSW, Ph.D.
Office: Belfer Hall Room 814
Phone: 212-960-6934

Spring, 2016
E-mail: caputo@yu.edu

I. COURSE DESCRIPTION

Literature reviews are an essential component of dissertations and if done in an exacting manner they can often stand alone on their merits as substantive scholarly contributions to the professional knowledge base. This course aims to build knowledge and skills related to (1) evaluating and synthesizing research primarily in academic publications and secondarily in government documents and other sources of information related to one's dissertation topic and (2) writing literature reviews that can be potentially successfully subjected to the peer review process.

The course (SWK8904) serves as the precursor to the Dissertation Proposal Seminar II (SWK8290), which provides a more comprehensive attempt to draft a dissertation proposal on a research topic of students' choosing. SWK8904 equips students with a set of ground rules, assumptions, and techniques for understanding scholarly work in a range of professional disciplines that comprise the social sciences, with an emphasis on social work and social welfare literature. Course content includes, among other things, searching out existing knowledge on a topic, analyzing arguments and ideas, mapping ideas, arguments and perspectives, analyzing qualitative research literature, analyzing quantitative literature, building tables to summarize the literature, producing a literature review, and making a case for investigating a researchable topic, presumably one that forms the basis of students' dissertations.

Readings and class discussions are designed to help students develop a reasonably coherent first draft of the literature review that forms the basis of their dissertations. Style, mechanics, and language use are scrutinized and students will also have the advantage of incorporating feedback by constructively critiquing each others work as they refine their first working drafts of the literature reviews. A comprehensive self-editing checklist for refining the final draft of the literature review is also provided.

II. EDUCATIONAL OBJECTIVES

A. Knowledge Objectives

At the end of the semester, students will know how to:

1. Undertake a comprehensive literature search.
2. Evaluate the theoretical and methodological merits of quantitative and qualitative research articles.
3. Synthesize findings from previous studies in tabular and narrative forms.
4. Write a literature review that coherently summarizes the extant literature, identifies gaps in that literature, suggests needed research, and lays the bases for studies that will form the basis of their dissertations.

B. Skill Objectives

At the end of the semester, students will be able to:

1. Identify and use effectively a variety of sources from which to gather extant literature about a topic of their choosing, one preferably related to their prospective dissertation proposal.
2. Evaluate the merits of case studies, narrative analyses, surveys, correlation studies, regression analysis studies, factor analysis studies, discriminant analysis, experimental and quasi-experimental studies.
3. Build tables to summarize the literature by topic, research questions and related hypotheses, use of theories (that is, as an orienting framework for variable selection, testing hypotheses, etc.), methods, and findings.
4. Prepare and use guidelines for writing the first draft of a literature review and developing a coherent essay.
5. Use appropriate guidelines to ensure correct style, mechanics, and language based on the *APA Publication Manual*, 6th edition.
6. Critique others' work and incorporate others' feedback to refine initial drafts of the literature review.
7. Self-edit and refine a final draft of the literature review.

III. COURSE REQUIREMENTS

A. Texts and Readings

Required Texts

Hart, C. (1998). *Doing a literature review: Releasing the social science research imagination*. Thousand Oakes, CA: Sage Publications. **ISBN-13:** 978-0761959755 Retail Price \$49.95

Pyrzczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals: A practical guide to realistic evaluation*. 4th ed. Glendale, CA: Pyrczak Publishing. **ISBN-13:** 978-1884585784 Retail Price \$39.95

Ridley, D. (2012). *The literature review: A step-by-step guide for students*. 2nd ed. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications. **ISBN-13:** 978-1-4462-0143-5 Retail Price \$40.00

Recommended Text

Machi, L.A., & McEvoy, B.T. (2012). *The literature review: Six steps to success* (2nd edition). Thousand Oakes, CA: Corwin. **ISBN-13:** 978-1452240886 Retail Price \$31.95

Examples of literature review articles available on e-reserve at the Pollack Library:

Bryant, J. (2007). Theories of fertility decline and the evidence from development indicators. *Population and Development Review*, 33(1), 101-127.

Burstein, P. (2003). The impact of public opinion on public policy: A review and an agenda. *Political Research Quarterly*, 56, 29-40.

Campbell, S.E., Seymore, D.G., & Primrose, W.R. (2004). A systematic literature review of factors affecting outcome in older medical patients admitted to hospital. *Age and Aging*, 33, 110-115.

Colucci, E., & Martin, G. (2007). Ethnocultural aspects of suicide in young people: A systematic literature review Part 1: Rates and methods of youth suicide. *Suicide & Life-Threatening Behavior*, 37, 197-221..

Colucci, E., & Martin, G. (2007). Ethnocultural aspects of suicide in young people: A systematic literature review Part 2: Risk factors, participating agents, and attitudes toward suicide. *Suicide & Life-Threatening Behavior*, 37, 222-237.

- Cottone, R.R., & Claus, R.E. (2000). Ethical decision-making models: A review of the literature. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 78*(3), 275-283.
- Denton, R.E., & Kampfe, C.M. (1994). The relationship between family variables and adolescent substance abuse: A literature review. *Adolescence, 29*(114), 475-495.
- Fong, R., & Mokuau, N. (1994). Not simply "Asian Americans": Periodical literature review on Asians and Pacific Islanders. *Social Work, 39*, 298-305.
- Fortner, B.V., & Neimeyer, R.A. (1999). Death anxiety in older adults: A quantitative review. *Death Studies, 23*, 387-411.
- Gagliardi, F. (2008). Institutions and economic change: A critical survey of the new institutional approaches and empirical evidence. *The Journal of Socio-Economics, 37*, 416-443.
- Gunter, B.G., & van der Hoeven, R. (2004). The social dimension of globalization: A review of the literature. *International Labour Review, 143*, 7-43.
- Hagen, B., Wong-Wylie, G., & Pijl-Zieber, E. (2010) Talk or tablets? A critical review of the literature comparing antidepressants and counseling for treatment of depression. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 32*(2), 102-124.
- Killian, K.D. (1994). Fearing fat: A literature review of family systems understandings and treatments of anorexia and bulimia. *Family Relations, 43*, 311-318.
- Lescheid, A.W., Cummings, A.L., Brunschot, M.V., Cunningham, A., & Saunders, A. (2001). Aggression in adolescent girls: Implications for policy, prevention, and treatment. *Canadian Psychology, 42*, 200-215.
- Lund, L.K., Zimmerman, T.S., & Haddock, S.A. (2002). The theory, structure, and techniques for the inclusion of children in family therapy: A literature review. *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy, 28*, 445-454.
- McCormick, A.J. (2011). Self-determination, the right to die, and culture: A literature review. *Social Work, 56*(2), 119-128.
- McGrath, P. (1999). Posttraumatic stress and the experience of cancer: A literature review. *Journal of Rehabilitation, 65*(3), 17-23.
- Millett, G.A., Peterson, J.L., Wolitski, R.J., & Stall, R. (2006). Greater risk of HIV infection of black men who have sex with men: A critical literature review. *American Journal of Public Health, 96*, 1007-1019.
- Modell, J., & Haggerty, T. (1991). The social impact of war. *Annual Review of Sociology, 17*, 205-244.

Moffitt, R.A. (1997). The effect of welfare on marriage and fertility: What do we know and what do we need to know? *Institute for Research on Poverty, Discussion Paper no. 1153-97*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin.

Morris, T.W., & Levinson, E.M. (1995). Relationship between intelligence and occupational adjustment and functioning: A literature review. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 73*, 503-514.

Vega, W.A. (1990). Hispanic families in the 1980s: A decade of research. *Journal of Marriage and the Family, 52*, 1015-1024.

B. Course Assignments

1. Readings

It is expected that all reading assignments listed as "required" in the course outline will be read and that students will make every effort to avail themselves of the recommended readings.

2. Specific Assignments

Assignment 1: Tabular Summaries of the Extant Literature

Students will prepare tables summarizing the extant literature of a topic of their choosing, preferably related to their prospective dissertations, by general topic areas, specific research questions and related hypotheses, use of theories (that is, as an orienting framework for variable selection, testing hypotheses, etc.), methods, and findings.

Due date: Classes 7&8

Assignment 2: Final Draft of the Literature Review

Students will write a literature review that coherently summarizes the extant literature, identifies gaps in that literature, suggests needed research, and lays the bases for studies that will form the basis of their dissertations.

Due date: Class 13

Maximum length: 12-15 pages (excluding references), double-spaced, 12-pitch font.

It is expected that assignments will be handed in on the due date.

Adherence to APA style of sectioning, referencing and margins is required. It is expected that students will evidence communication skills consistent with doctoral education standards. Students are advised to carefully proofread their written work (by self and others) before they submit it.

- C. Class Design: This class is organized as a seminar. Students are expected to submit their work to each other's scrutiny for critique and mutual feedback. Active participation in class discussions is requisite.
- D. Grading: The University grading system will be applied. The grade will be based upon the extent to which the student meets the course objectives, as demonstrated in the form, content and promptness of written assignments as well as class attendance and participation.

Criteria for final grades are:

1.	Tabular Summary of the Literature	30%
2.	Final draft of the Literature Review	55%
3.	Critique, feedback, & class participation	15%

- E. Evaluation: Students are provided opportunity to evaluate doctoral courses. An evaluation form pertaining to the course and instructor will be distributed at the last class session. There will also be oral discussion of students' perspectives about the course.

Evaluation is ongoing. Students are encouraged to provide feedback about their learning needs throughout the semester.

- G. Plagiarism: Students should remember that the School will not condone plagiarism in any form and will sanction acts of plagiarism. A student who presents someone else's work as his or her own work is stealing from the authors or persons who did the original thinking and writing. Plagiarism occurs when a student directly copies another's work without citation; when a student paraphrases major aspects of another's work without citation; and when a student combines the work of different authors into a new statement without reference to those authors. It is also plagiarism to use the ideas and/or work of another student and present them as your own. It is not plagiarism to formulate your own presentation of an idea or concept as a reaction to someone else's work; however, the work to which you are reacting should be discussed and appropriately cited. Any student who can be shown to have plagiarized any part of any assignment in this course will automatically FAIL the course and will be referred to the Associate Dean for disciplinary action that may include expulsion.

- H. **HIPPA ALERT:** In line with the new HIPPA regulations concerning protected health information, it is important that you understand that any case information you present from your work will need to be de-identified. What this means is that any information that would allow another to identify the person needs to be changed or eliminated. This includes obvious things like names and birth dates but may also contain other information that is so unique to the person that it will allow for identification, including diagnosis, race/ethnicity, or gender. If diagnosis, race/ethnicity, or gender is directly related to the case presentation it can be included if it will not allow for identification.

COURSE SCHEDULE

Class 1 INTRODUCTION & OVERVIEW OF THE COURSE

Overview of course and course assignments
Purposes of Literature Reviews
Role of Literature Reviews in Research
Planning the Literature Review

Required Reading:

Hart, C. (1998). *Doing a literature review*, Chapter 1, “The literature review in research” (pp. 1-25) and Chapter 2, “Reviewing and the research imagination” (pp. 26-43).

Ridley, D. (2012). *The literature review: A step-by-step guide for students*. 2nd ed., Chapter 1, “Introduction” and Chapter 2, “The multiple purposes of a literature review.”

Yorks, L. (2008). What we know, what we don’t know, what we need to know – Integrative literature reviews are research. *Human Resource Development Review*, 7, 139-141.

Class 2 SEARCHING THE LITERATURE

Going beyond the Internet
Classification of research & theory

Required Readings

Ridley, D. (2012). *The literature review: A step-by-step guide for students*. 2nd ed., Chapter 3, “Sources of information and conducting searches.”

Class 3 ORGANIZING IDEAS

Arguments
Expressing ideas

Mapping ideas

Required Readings

Hart, C. (1998). *Doing a literature review*, Chapter 4, “Argumentation analysis” (pp. 79-108), Chapter 5, “Organizing and expressing ideas” (pp. 109-141), and Chapter 6, “Mapping and analyzing ideas” (pp. 142-171).

Class 4 EVALUATING BASIC COMPONENTS OF RESEARCH LITERATURE

Background considerations

Titles

Abstracts

Introductions

Required Readings

Pyrczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals* (4th edition). Chapter 1, “Background for evaluating research reports” (pp. 1-12), Chapter 2, “Evaluating titles” (pp. 13-22), Chapter 3, “Evaluating abstracts” (pp. 23-32), Chapter 4, “Evaluating introductions and literature reviews” (pp. 33-46), and Chapter 5, “A closer look at evaluating literature reviews” (pp. 47-54).

Class 5 EVALUATING RESEARCH ARTICLES BY TYPE OF STUDY: QUANTITATIVE STUDIES I

Evaluating samples

Evaluating instrumentation

Surveys

Required Readings

Pyrczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals* (4th edition). Chapter 6, “Evaluating samples when researchers generalize” (pp. 55-68), Chapter 7, “Evaluating samples when researchers do *not* generalize” (pp. 69-76), and Chapter 8, “Evaluating instrumentation” (pp. 77-90).

**Class 6 EVALUATING RESEARCH ARTICLES BY TYPE OF STUDY:
QUANTITATIVE STUDIES II**

Evaluating experimental procedures
Evaluating statistical procedures

Required Readings

Pyrczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals* (4th edition). Chapter 9, "Evaluating experimental procedures" (pp. 91-102).

**Class 7 EVALUATING RESEARCH ARTICLES BY TYPE OF STUDY:
QUANTITATIVE STUDIES III**

Evaluating analyses
Evaluating results

Required Readings

Pyrczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals* (4th edition). Chapter 10, "Evaluating analysis and results sections: Quantitative research" (pp. 103-110) and Appendix C, "The limits of significance testing" (pp. 147-150).

**Class 8 EVALUATING RESEARCH ARTICLES BY TYPE OF STUDY:
QUALITATIVE STUDIES I**

Evaluating analyses
Evaluating results

Required Readings

Pyrczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals* (4th edition). Chapter 11, "Evaluating analysis and results sections: Qualitative research" (pp. 111-120).

**Class 9 EVALUATING RESEARCH ARTICLES BY TYPE OF STUDY:
QUALITATIVE STUDIES II**

Case and narrative studies
Evaluating analyses
Evaluating results

Required Readings

Pyrczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals* (4th edition). Appendix B, "Examining the validity structure of qualitative research" (pp. 139-145).

Class 10 BUILDING TABLES

Tabular summaries of the literature

Required Readings

Galvan, J.L. (2006). *Writing literature reviews* (3rd edition), Chapter 7, “Building tables to summarize literature” (pp. 63-69).

Galvan, J.L. (2006). *Writing literature reviews* (3rd edition), Chapter 8, “Synthesizing literature prior to writing a review” (pp. 71-90).

Class 11 WRITING THE REVIEW
 Tabular summaries of the literature

Required Readings

Ridley, D. (2012). *The literature review: A step-by-step guide for students*. 2nd ed., Chapter 4, “Reading and note taking strategies.”

Pyrzczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals* (4th edition). Chapter 13, “Putting it all together” (pp. 129-133) and Appendix D, “Checklist of evaluation questions” (pp. 151-156).

Classes 12-14 STUDENT CRITIQUES OF EACH OTHERS WORK

Class 15 Catching Up, Tying Up Loose Ends

COURSE EVALUATION

Bibliography (Helpful Texts)

- Cooper, H. (1998). *Synthesizing research: A guide for literature reviews*. 3rd ed. Thousand Oakes, CA: Sage Publications. **ISBN-13:** 978-0761913481 Retail Price \$51.95
- Cooper, H., & Hedges, L.V. (Eds.). (2009). *The handbook of research synthesis*. 2nd ed. New York: Russell Sage Foundation. **ISBN-13:** 978-0871541635 Retail Price \$65.95
- Fink, A. (2009). *Conducting research literature reviews: From the internet to paper*. 3rd ed. Thousand Oakes, CA: Sage Publications. **ISBN-13:** 978-1412971898 Retail Price \$53.95
- Galvin, J.L. (2009). *Writing literature reviews: A guide for students of the social and behavioral sciences*. 4th ed. Glendale, CA: Pyczak Publishing. **ISBN-13:** 978-1884585869 Retail Price \$42.50
- Girden, E.R. (2001). *Evaluating research articles: From start to finish*. 3rd ed. Thousand Oakes, CA: Sage Publications. **ISBN-13:** 978-1412974462 Retail Price \$55.95
- Hart, C. (2001). *Doing a literature search: A comprehensive guide for the social sciences*. Thousand Oakes, CA: Sage Publications. **ISBN-13:** 978-0761968108 Retail Price \$53.95
- Machi, L.A., & McEvoy, B.T. (2009). *The literature review: Six steps to success*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press. **ISBN-13:** 978-1412961356 Retail Price \$20.95
- Mogck, B.D. (2008). *Writing to reason: A companion for philosophy students and instructors*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing. **ISBN-13:** 978-1405170994 Retail Price \$24.95
- National Health and Medical Research Council (1999). *How to review the evidence: Systematic identification and review of the scientific literature*. Washington, DC: Author. Available at https://www.nhmrc.gov.au/_files_nhmrc/file/publications/synopses/cp65.pdf
- Pyczak, F. (2008). *Evaluating research in academic journals: A practical guide to realistic evaluation*. 4th ed. Glendale, CA: Pyczak Publishing. **ISBN-13:** 978-1884585784 Retail Price \$39.95
- Sandelowski, M., & Barroso, J. (2007). *Handbook for synthesizing qualitative research*. New York: Springer Publishing Company. **ISBN-13:** 978-0826156945 Retail Price \$62.00